

TYNDALE COLLEGE AND SEMINARY

MODERN THEOLOGY OF RESTORATIONISM

SUBMITTED TO
DR. VAN JOHNSON
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS FOR
PENTECOSTAL ISSUES
PENT 0701

MASTER'S OF THEOLOGICAL STUDIES DEPARTMENT

BY
ELAINE MILLEY
LABRADOR CITY, NL
A2V 1R8

APRIL 2005

TABLE OF CONTENT

INTRODUCTION

EDWARD IRVING	4
THE NEW APOSTOLIC CHURCH	6
DANIEL AWREY	7
PROPHETIC INDEPENDENT CHURCHES IN AFRICA	8
THE LATTER RAIN MOVEMENT	9
DAVID (PAUL) YONGGI CHO	10
VINEYARD CHRISTIAN FELLOWSHIP	11
AUSTRALIAN ASSEMBLIES OF GOD	13
RICK JOYNER	14
CINDY JACOBS	15
KANSAS CITY PROPHETS	16
NEW WINE	18
PETER WAGNER AND THE NEW APOSTOLIC REFORMATION	18
GLOBAL HARVEST MINISTRIES	20
TORONTO BLESSING	22
BROWNSVILLE REVIVAL	24
ARGENTINA	25
OBSERVATIONS	26
CONCLUSION	28
BIBLIOGRAPHY	30

Introduction

Though there has been increased popularity in restoration ministries over the past twenty to twenty-five years, the practice of establishing apostles as spiritual leaders, and the reliance upon prophecy for spiritual direction is nothing new. There have been several attempts to build movements on the basis of apostolic authority and prophetic guidance over the past 100-150 years. Many of these movements have not stood the test of time, and whether or not current restoration movements will be more successful is yet to be determined.

In North America the most prominent name that surfaces when discussing apostolic restoration is C. Peter Wagner who has widely publicized his New Apostolic Reformation theology. However, it should be noted that Wagner is not the initiator of this theology, nor is he the only person promoting and practicing it. There are numerous restoration movements around the world, some of which have existed for many years.

It is important to note that even though the many branches and personalities profiled in this paper have diverse areas of focus, each of them hold a common interpretation of Ephesians 4:11. While the church has generally accepted that the offices of apostle and prophet ended around the end of the first century, restoration movements consider these offices necessary for today, and therefore seek to restore them. As one author said, “It has recently become popular to speak of ‘the five-fold ministry,’ a system of church government with apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors, and teachers. . . . Some have objected that there is no reason to bracket off the apostles and prophets from the other three offices listed in verse 11.”¹

¹Robert Bowman, “The Faulty Foundation of The Five-Fold Ministry,” *Apologetics Index*, May 27, 2001, <http://www.apologeticsindex.org/f09.html>.

The purpose of this paper is to trace some of the history of restoration theology by examining the people and branches of the movement that have made attempts to promote it. Special attention will be given to the spread of this movement and the similarities and differences in the theology of each of the branches. An attempt will be made to present the people and movements in chronological order according to the time of their establishment, although some overlap. After examining the prominent people and branches some general observations will be made.

Edward Irving

There is a movement dating back to 1830 that developed into an international denomination based on apostolic church government. This movement began in England and was called the Catholic Apostolic Church (CAC). The CAC was also known for recognizing the expression of the NT Charismata of 1 Cor. 12:8-10.² Because Edward Irving is credited with the establishment of this movement, the group is often referred to as the Irvingites. Irving, who was influenced by the ideas of Samuel Taylor Coleridge and Thomas Carlyle, was convinced that he was a prophet. He believed that because the church had abandoned the offices of apostle and prophet, the Holy Spirit had left the church to its own devices.

Prior to establishing the CAC, Irving was a Presbyterian minister in England. While in that position, Irving gained a reputation for his emphasis on eschatology, and he even predicted the end of the world. He and his associates also prayed for an outpouring of the Holy Spirit, and in the early 1830s parishioners became very charismatic and even

²D.W. Dorris, "Catholic Apostolic Church," in the New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements, Stanley M. Burgess and Eduard M. Van Der Maas, editors, (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2003), 459.

spoke in tongues and began to give prophetic utterances. Irving was eventually expelled from his Presbyterian church, and at that time he took about 800 members with him. This was the beginning of the CAC.³

The aim of the CAC was to restore the fourfold gift ministries of Ephesians 4:11. This group opted to identify four gifts rather than five because they interpreted the gifts of pastor and teacher as one ministry. The CAC was organized according to apostolic authority. Though Irving considered himself an apostle, this was not the consensus of his followers, as Irving had never experienced charismata himself. While others in the movement did earn the title of apostle, followers considered Irving an angel, and therefore removed him from the center of power in the movement.

While the Irvingites believed in restoring apostolic ministry, they limited the number of apostles to twelve, and held fast to the notion that Jesus would return during the lifetime of those twelve apostles. As those apostles began to die, they saw no need of appointing new apostles to replace them because they anticipated the imminent return of Christ. Though this movement was quite vibrant in the 1800's, it has since become nearly extinct following the death of the last apostle in 1901.

This movement predates the events of Azusa Street by more than seventy years, yet some believe that the Pentecostal movement of the United States had a connection to the CAC because one of the founding fathers, Charles Parham, made mention of Irving. Pentecostal Theologians have often reflected on the Irving phenomenon to help them evaluate their own experiences.

³ D.D. Bundy, "Irving, Edward," in the *New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, 803.

The New Apostolic Church

There was one branch of the CAC that did experience substantial growth and it continues to thrive even today, it is called the New Apostolic Church. In 1863, Thomas Carlyle, an apostle of the CAC, established the New Apostolic Church (NAC) in Germany. A point of contention developed between these two movements however when the NAC tried to persuade the CAC to establish more apostles. The NAC believed the number of apostles should be unlimited, and they continued to ordain new apostles despite the CAC's reluctance to accept this practice.⁴

“Since 1988, the Chief Apostle of the New Apostolic Church has been Richard Fehr. He leads the church from its head offices in Zurich, Switzerland. Richard Fehr is a Swiss national and the seventh Chief Apostle since the foundation of the Church. His position can be compared to the one Peter had 2,000 years ago in the circle of the Apostles.”⁵

Locating a doctrinal statement for the NAC has proved difficult, however, one internet site⁶ has translated some statements from official NAC German documents into English. These statements demonstrate the doctrines promoted by this movement. According to this site, the NAC believes that since the death of the first apostles, no salvation was possible until the establishment of the NAC in the 1830's. The NAC is the only way to find salvation. While other churches speak about God, God himself speaks

⁴Dorries, D.W., “New Apostolic Church,” in the *New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, 928-929.

⁵Peter Johanning, “The New Apostolic Church: Decentralised Structures and Duties of Ministries,” *New Apostolic Church International*, March 5, 2004, <http://www.nak.org/text/6-gb.html#1>.

⁶Armin and Julia, “Special Doctrines of the NAC,” May 10, 1997, http://www.naki.de/_nak_eng/nak_lehre_e.htm.

through the NAC. They believe that the ability to interpret the bible is limited to the apostles, and God also speaks fresh new words to his people through the apostles. Even though the apostles are given authority to interpret scripture and communicate new messages from God, education is not valued and it does not assist people in attaining positions of leadership in this movement. Among many other things that would be difficult for some evangelicals to accept, the NAC also believes that salvation is possible after death.

The NAC reached its highest rate of growth in the 60s and 70s, and according to Dorries “in the 1990s the NAC is approaching 16 million members in approximately 60,000 congregations worldwide. The number of apostles has reached nearly 300.”⁷

Daniel Awrey

Daniel Awrey was born in Canada in 1869 but moved to Minnesota with his family in 1887. He received salvation in 1890 and by the end of the year he had been filled with the Holy Spirit and spoke in tongues. He became an elder at the Congregational Methodist Church in Tennessee in 1893. In 1895 he claimed to receive the gift of prophecy. He defined this gift as special preaching unction and the ability to predict future events. He was an evangelist, teacher and missionary. He also preached divine healing, baptism of the Holy Spirit, and sanctification. Later he traveled extensively preaching on the proper use, and potential abuse of spiritual gifts. He especially emphasized the need to seek the full restoration of the five-fold ministry offices according to Ephesians 4:11.⁸

⁷ Dorries, “New Apostolic Church,” 929.

⁸D. Woods, “Awrey, Daniel P.,” in the *New International Dictionary of Pentecostal Charismatic Movements*, 344.

According to Harold Hunter, Awrey circled the globe in 1909 and participated in a Pentecostal world conference. He then returned to the United States to run Emmanuel's Bible School in Beulah, Oklahoma where he helped train prominent leaders. In 1910-11 he went to India and China with Frank Bartleman, an Azusa Street revival leader. Hunter notes that Awrey used little of his abundant offerings, but opted rather to give to others. He even sat up in trains all night rather than incur the expense of hotel rooms. As a result he was able to send thousands of dollars to missionaries.⁹

Prophetic Independent Churches in Africa

Some African charismatics, claiming to be called by God through visions and prophetic utterances, are the prominent voices of the Prophetic Independent Churches in Africa. The founders focused on their local communities and emphasized prayer as the solution to human need and life's problems. They believed that God gave them the mission of establishing prayer, healing and prophecy. These churches, which began in the early twentieth century, incorporate aspects of African religious worldviews and realities and they also borrow heavily from African religious idioms.

They desired freedom from foreign teaching that did not encourage African indigenous spiritual heritage. Though these leaders promoted faith healing, prophetic visions, fervent ecstatic prayer and glossolalia like their charismatic counterparts elsewhere in the world, they also took the African cosmological worldview seriously. This included the reality of witchcraft, predestination, the world of spirits and ancestors,

⁹Harold Hunter, "Centennial Notes," *International Pentecostal Holiness Church*, March 12, 2005, <http://www.iphc.org/docs/timeline/cuba.html>.

and so on. Though they employ African traditions and cultural symbols, they also reject African beliefs and religious practices, labeling them as pagan.

Like other prophetic movements these churches are loosely organized. Sole authority is given to the founding prophets whose utterances, instructions and pronouncements are often backed up by revelations and visions and are considered divinely inspired and therefore cannot be questioned. One of the most significant characteristics of the prophetic churches in Africa is faith healing and there is also a preoccupation with holiness.¹⁰

The Latter Rain Movement

This charismatic movement of the mid 20th century originated at Sharon Orphanage and Schools in North Battleford, Saskatchewan. The Latter Rain Movement relates to this discussion on the restoration movement because those involved in the Latter Rain Movement felt that,

. . . insights into the Word of God had been given by the Holy Spirit within the context of the 1948 revival by prophetic revelation. This ‘blaze of prophetic light’ was not restricted to the penetration of mysteries within the Bible but included the unveiling of people’s lives and hearts through the agency of the Spirit of God working through the laying on of the hands of ‘prophets and apostles of His choosing.’¹¹

This five-fold movement was characterized by healing, miraculous phenomena, laying on of hands, and exercising spiritual gifts. Though these seem to be consistent with Pentecostal practices, the Latter Rain Movement was discredited by Pentecostal denominations because,

¹⁰Information under the heading “Prophetic Independent Churches in Africa,” is a summary of an article by, J.K. Olupona, “Africa, West,” in the *New International Dictionary of Pentecostal Charismatic Movements*, 12-14.

¹¹R.M. Riss, “Latter Rain Movement,” in *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, 831-832.

(1) It relied too heavily upon present-day apostles and prophets (i.e., a self-appointed charismatic leadership); (2) it practiced the confessing and pronouncing of forgiveness by one member upon another; (3) it advocated the practice of bestowing spiritual gifts by the laying-on-of-hands; and (4) it distorted Scripture so as to arrive at conclusions not generally accepted by members of the Assemblies.¹²

David (Paul) Yonggi Cho

David (Paul) Yonggi Cho is the pastor of the world's largest congregation in Seoul, Korea. The congregation began in 1958 and now has an estimated 700,000 – 850,000 members. Prayer and cell group ministry is greatly emphasized in this congregation and these have attributed to its phenomenal growth.

Though Yonggi Cho's name consistently came to the forefront while examining this topic, several hours of research proved fruitless in discovering any direct claim by Dr. Cho regarding his desire to restore the five-fold ministry. No evidence could be found that he considers himself part of the restoration movement. However, many of the leading people of the restoration movement have indicated a connection to Dr. Cho. For example, websites highlighting the success of the Toronto Blessing, C. Peter Wagner, the Pensecola Revival, the Vineyard movement, all make mention of Cho and his contributions to their success. Many leaders of the restoration movement hold Dr. Cho in high esteem. The numerous references to Cho cannot be ignored.

Cho is mainly known for his 'name it and claim it' doctrine, also known as 'word faith' theology. Like those who claim to be prophets, Cho puts a lot of emphasis on the power of the spoken word. Elements of Cho's teaching can be seen through the different

¹² Charleen Buttner, "Latter Rain," *New Religious Movements*, July 19, 2001, <http://religiousmovements.lib.virginia.edu/nrms/Latrain.html>.

branches of the restoration movement. The following is an example of some of Cho's teaching.

Pastor Cho's success formula is a combination of positive thinking and positive confession: 'Think it. See it. Name it. Speak it – in boldness.' He teaches that through the power of the spoken word the Spirit-led believer can 'create and release the presence of Jesus Christ.' He emphasizes being specific in prayer: one must visualize and specify exactly what is needed. This implies financial prosperity, but it is not an instant cure-all. . . . Coming out of the oriental tradition, Cho has emphasized the mystical, including the power of satanic forces. But at the same time he has elevated the believer even more – to the 'class of gods' as children of God who have power over the angelic class (including Satan).¹³

Vineyard Christian Fellowship

This group of 500 national churches, and as many as 1200 churches internationally attribute their establishment to John Wimber (1934-98). The success of this movement began with the first congregation called Vineyard Christian Fellowship of Anaheim in California. It was established in 1977. Formerly associated with Chuck Smith's Calvary Chapel fellowship, Wimber joined a group of churches called the 'Vineyards' in 1993. Prior to that Wimber was associated with C. Peter Wagner. Their relationship began in 1975 when Wimber started teaching at Fuller Theological Seminary. Wimber focused a lot on signs and wonders teaching, and gained popularity as a national speaker after seeing dramatic results in his Anaheim congregation. This movement is also referred to as The Third Wave.

Wimber taught that prophets and apostles are being restored today. He relied greatly on prophetic utterances, and even operated as a prophet himself. He also took the Kansas City Prophets under his care when they encountered some problems. Wimber believed that Paul Cain of the Kansas City Prophets was the premier prophet of the Third

¹³D.J. Wilson, "Cho, David (Paul) Yonggi," in *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, 521-522.

Wave. He said that Cain was much like Jeremiah and John the Baptist. Wimber said of Cain's prophetic ability, that, "He's interacting in two dimensions continually. He's not only seeing you and talking to you, but he's, uh, hearing from God constantly. There's a continual flow. I think it's interrupted periodically, but a continual flow of information coming to him about things."¹⁴

He later admitted that accepting the Kansas City Prophets into the Vineyard Movement was a mistake, for which he took responsibility. He said,

However, their entrance into the Vineyard was entirely my fault, and I take full responsibility for that . I turned my brain off for a couple of years. . . . I loved the gifts the prophets exercised; I didn't like the package. The package involved the presupposition that a gift in itself authenticates you. I don't care if your the finest communicator around, the finest expositor, the most brilliant theologian - if you can't come under the church, if you can't commit yourself to a board, if you can't commit yourself to the leadership of others, if you can't commit yourself to collegiality and relationships, if you can't be inspected as well as teach, I don't want to play.¹⁵

Beyond his support of modern prophets and apostles, and his emphasis on signs and wonders teaching, another distinctive mark of Wimber's teaching is that of his Kingdom Theology. By his supporters, John Wimber was called the Prophet of the Kingdom, and in regards to his kingdom beliefs Wimber made the following statement,

At Fuller I was introduced to the writings of George Eldon Ladd, especially his books *The Presence of the Future* and *Critical Questions about the Kingdom of God*. From Dr. Ladd I came to believe that the kingdom of God is, in fact, relevant to our lives today. As I read George Ladd's books and reread the Gospels, I realized that at the very heart of THE GOSPEL lies the kingdom of God and that power for effective evangelism and discipleship relates directly to our understanding and experiencing the kingdom today. This revelation remains the

¹⁴Hank Hanegraff, "The Counterfeit Revival," *Watch Unto Prayer*, Exerts from a 1997 radio broadcast, <http://watch.pair.com/counterfeit.html>.

¹⁵Gary A. Hand, "Conversations With A Charismatic," *On Doctrine*, 2002, <http://www.ondocctrine.com/conversa/3char002.htm>.

most significant spiritual experience since my conversion in 1963, because thereafter I explored the practical implications of the presence of the kingdom.¹⁶

People who teach Kingdom Now Theology believe that Christians must conquer the world before Christ returns. They feel that leading this task is the responsibility of modern apostles. Kingdom Now Theology has some beliefs in common with the Latter Rain Movement.

Australian Assemblies Of God

Though this movement began in 1907, it experienced a slow rate of growth and even encountered fruitless years between the 1930s and mid 1970s. However, this movement was transformed and began to grow quite rapidly when they acknowledged apostolic ministry and were transformed as a movement between 1977-1979. Twenty-three years later they recorded 700% as many churches, 2000% increase in attendance and ten times more credentialed workers.

Their first encounter with apostles was in 1930 when the Apostolic Church from Wales came and appointed apostles and prophets. This action was met with resistance and was blamed for derailing the movement. However, in 1977 Dr. Yonggi Cho was the conference speaker and he imparted gifts to the younger ministers at that conference.

Following that conference, the Australian AOG put an end to congregational government, they rejected democracy and what they called the bureaucratic model of leadership. Their attention was turned to church planting that was initiated from mother churches rather than the denomination itself. There was also a great emphasis on youth ministry and releasing women to use their gifts. This movement is more loosely structured than it was prior to the 70s, however they still have regional and state systems

¹⁶John Wimber, *Kingdom Come*, (Servant Publications, 1988), p.7

for dealing with communication, credentialing and discipline. David Cartledge stresses that the people in this movement place little emphasis on titles.¹⁷

Though the Australian Assemblies of God promotes the use of modern apostles and prophets, it appears as though it has little else in common with other restoration movements. There is no indication that they promote some of the theology that is prominent in other branches. There is no mention of Word Faith, Kingdom Now, Health and Prosperity teaching, etc. Also there is no sign that the authority of apostles and prophets is considered superior to scripture.

Rick Joyner

Rick Joyner appeared from nowhere in the mid eighties claiming to receive regular messages from God. Since then he has attracted a sizeable following. His ministry is now a \$5 million a year operation. Joyner dropped out of high school but later earned his GED. Though Joyner claims to have special revelation from God, he says his message is not about elitism, but humility. He does not consider his visions and prophecies to be on the same level as scripture. His passion is to hear God accurately and teach others to hear him also. He emphasizes using the gift of prophecy properly in accordance with 1 Corinthians 12-14.

In his services he calls a member out of the congregation and gets them to stand before the church. He then encourages other members to speak words the Lord has laid on their hearts concerning that individual. Joyner thinks it is important to provide a place for people to try prophesying and not be condemned if they make a mistake. He notes that nobody in his church claims to be infallible, he simply wants to provide an

¹⁷Information under the heading "Australian Assemblies of God" is a summary of a presentation made by David Cartledge, "Blueprint for Change Conference," (Hyatt Regency Hotel: DFW Airport), September 19-20, 2002.

opportunity for people to articulate what they feel God is showing them. He says that such people must be willing to take correction, and if they are not, then he will not give them the platform. In reference to personal accountability, Joyner says that he is accountable to his board and to a larger roundtable of church leaders who meet annually.

In 1998 Joyner predicted a series of disasters would strike Southern California, including acts of terrorism, but nothing happened. Joyner later apologized and said the warning had been misunderstood. In his books he speaks of personal prophetic experiences, visions and vivid dreams. He admits that these mystical experiences can be affected or distorted by an individual's personal feelings and doctrinal background. He says that at best, prophetic experiences are merely tools God uses to illuminate Scripture.

One event that has caused ongoing controversy is Joyner's association with the Knights of Malta, a charitable organization that allegedly has its roots in medieval chivalry. This connection has troubled some in the prophetic movement, but Joyner finds rich Christian symbolism in the Knights of Malta. He refers to brave warriors, armed knights defending the Holy Land – and plenty of swords. On occasion he has given decorative medieval swords to his closest friends suggesting they symbolize the power of the prophetic Word of God. Joyner has urged his friends to be knighted in an inner circle, and some have observed that those willing to do so have a special bond with him.¹⁸

Cindy Jacobs

Cindy Jacobs is the president of an organization called Generals International (formerly Generals of Intercession). On her website,¹⁹ Jacobs calls herself a Prophetess to

¹⁸Information on Rick Joyner is a summary of an article by Cedrick Harmon, "God's Lightning Rod," *Charisma and Christian Life*, (26:9), April 2001.

¹⁹"Generals International," 2003. <http://www.generals.org/>.

the nations and says she is committed to transforming the world through prophetic and intercessory prayer. Theologically she identifies with many of today's prophets and apostles. Cindy and her husband Mike founded Generals of Intercession in 1985. The global headquarters for Generals International is located in Texas, where Mike and Cindy currently reside. A major focus of her ministry is relative to mobilizing strategic intercession to tear down strongholds. She focuses a lot on spiritual warfare.

In 1996, Cindy was asked by C. Peter Wagner to coordinate the Spiritual Warfare Network for the United States. Wagner refers to Jacobs often in his writings and undoubtedly puts a lot of trust in her prophecies. He also considers her to be one of his personal intercessors. Cindy has also become an international director of Women's Aglow, a convener of the Spiritual Warfare Network, and is involved in the AD 2000 Prayer Track as well as being on the board of directors for March for Jesus USA.²⁰

Kansas City Prophets

The most popular names associated with the Kansas City Prophets (KCP) are Mike Bickle, Paul Cain and John Paul Jackson. These men were connected to the Kansas City Fellowship (KCF) that began when Mike Bickle, who was inspired by a prophecy he received, founded the church in 1982. By 1987 Paul Cain began receiving recognition as one of the main spokesman for the KCF, this church was based on Latter Rain Theology. Cain has since received recognition as both prophet and apostle.²¹

²⁰P.D. Hocken, "Jacobs, Cindy," in *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, 806.

²¹G.W. Gohr, "Kansas City Prophets," in *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, 816-817.

William Branham influenced Paul Cain in the 1950s. Braham proclaimed that he had an angel guiding him, and he discerned people's illnesses and thoughts. Healing was a major component of his evangelistic crusades.²² Cain considered Branham to be the greatest prophet who ever lived.

Several prophets from the KCP formed an organization in 1986 called Grace Ministries. It is described as "a ministry team of men committed to seeing the church fully restored to the glory described in God's Word. . . . Grace Ministries is a parachurch organization that represents several men who engage in itinerant, allegedly prophetic, ministries."²³ Prophets from this movement have gone on to take a leading role in the formation of the New Apostolic Church.

The KCP encountered difficulties in January of 1990 when Ernest Green released a document listing erroneous prophecies and teachings of the movement. This controversy "seems to have died down since John Wimber came forward to offer them a 'covering' through affiliation with the Vineyard Movement."²⁴ Wimber dealt with some errors including the lack of accountability for prophecies and he even removed Prophet Bob Jones from public ministry. The relationship between the KCP and Vineyard continued until 1996 when Vineyard and Toronto Airport Church parted ways. It was at that time the group adopted its new name, Metro Christian Fellowship. Cain continues to promote Latter Rain Teachings and was deeply involved with the Toronto Blessing.

²²D.J. Wilson, "Branham, William Marron," in *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, 440-441.

²³Bill Randles, "The Kansas City Prophets," *Calvary Home Page*, <http://www.picknowl.com.au/homepages/rlistar/charis/randles/randle7.htm>.

²⁴Bill Randles, "The Kansas City Prophets."

New Wine

New Wine is an Anglican Renewal Movement that was established in 1989 by David and Mary Pytches of England. Their influence has since been felt in many other countries, including Canada. This movement seeks to restore the five-fold ministry of Ephesians 4:11, with special emphasis on prophecy. The **“New Wine seeks to ‘equip Churches to see Jesus’ Kingdom grow,’ and all its events and activities are designed to enable Churches and their members to reproduce Jesus’ ministry and His focus on living and revealing the Kingdom of God in the gifts and power of the Holy Spirit – in their own local community.”**²⁵ As with other networks which promote kingdom restoration, there is a great emphasis on social responsibility. They also have a sister organization especially intended for youth entitled ‘Soul Survivor.’ At recent gatherings of New Wine supporters, they recorded the attendance of 18,000 delegates to their New Wine Conference, and over 20,000 delegates to Soul Survivor events.

Peter Wagner and the New Apostolic Reformation

In the early 1990s Peter Wagner and his wife Doris began to hear the Holy Spirit speaking about restoring apostles and prophets as the foundation of the church according to Ephesians 2:19-20. His book “Apostles and Prophets: The Foundation of the Church,” gives an account of Wagner’s theological development and the people who contributed to persuading him that God was working through apostles and prophets in this day. After some soul searching Wagner concluded that “the church cannot be all God wants it to be

²⁵Bruce Collins, “New Wine Sees Encouraging Growth in England,” *Anglican Renewal Movement Wales*, October 19, 2002, <http://www.anglicanrenewalministries-wales.org.uk/main/magazine/issue29/BCollins.htm>

unless – and until – the divinely ordained government of the church is solidly in place.”²⁶

Wagner also concluded that God had given him the gift of an apostle, and he said that the body of Christ confirmed this in that they recognized it also. It was John Wimber of the Vineyard movement who played an important role in persuading Wagner to accept the ministry of prophets, and it was Paul Cain of the Kansas City Prophets who persuaded Wimber.

Wagner is well known for his theology and teaching on the New Apostolic Reformation. In an article written by Wagner himself in the *New International Dictionary of Pentecostal Charismatic Movements*,²⁷ Wagner calls this a renewal movement and says it is changing the shape of Protestant Christianity around the world. The changes Wagner attributes to this movement include church government, interchurch relationships, financing, evangelism, missions, prayer, leadership selection and training, the role of supernatural power, worship, and other important aspects of church life.

There is an intended omission of the use of the word ‘denominations’ in this movement, as they prefer to describe themselves as loosely structured apostolic networks. Wagner claims that in virtually every region of the world these churches constitute one of the fastest-growing segments of Christianity. The major difference between apostolic networks and denominations is that the former leaves leadership decisions to individuals, i.e. apostles, and the latter depends more on the decisions of groups, i.e. congregation and/or a governing board.

²⁶C. Peter Wagner, *Apostles and Prophets: The Foundation of the Church*, (Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 2000).

²⁷ C. Peter Wagner, “New Apostolic Reformation,” in *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, 990.

Global Harvest Ministries

Peter and Doris Wagner also established Global Harvest Ministries²⁸ (GHM) in 1991. The purpose of this group was to activate the United Prayer Track. In the 1990s GHM focused mainly on evangelizing the 10/40 window. In 1996 they moved from California to Colorado Springs and partnered with Luis Bush to establish the World Prayer Center. Chuck Pierce was invited to join GHM leadership team as Pierce is perceived as having an “accurate prophetic gifting which helps direct nations, cities, churches and individuals in understanding the times and seasons we live in.”²⁹ Wagner attributes the spreading of the gospel in the 10/40 window to the efforts of GHM, and has since enlarged their vision to include the 40/70 window. Wagner now serves as the International Apostle over the Strategic Prayer Network and he has delegated leadership to Cindy Jacobs and Chuck Pierce.

On the Global Harvest website, Wagner addresses ‘What the Spirit is Saying to the Churches.’ Wagner says that because we live in age of incremental change, the Spirit is saying new things to the body of Christ, and it is time to stop living in the past. God is doing something new, and he sees GHM as playing an important role in developing God’s new strategy, or what he refers to as developing new wineskins. In order to play this important role many methods have been adopted by the GHM, these are listed and described below.

²⁸ C. Peter Wagner, “Global Harvest Ministries: Yesterday, Today and Tomorrow!” *Global Harvest Ministries*, 2002, <http://www.globalharvest.org/index.asp?action=about>.

²⁹ “Church D. Pierce,” *Glory of Zion International Ministries*, 2004, http://www.glory-of-zion.org/pierce_0.htm.

- Conferences: Conferences play a major role in the ministry of GHM. The purpose of conferences is to provide an opportunity to teach what God is saying to the church, and also to give the spiritual impartation needed to flow in new streams.
- The Wagner Leadership Institute (WLI): The purpose of this institute is to train Christian leaders. There are international branches in Canada, South Pacific (12 nations), Central Asia (9 nations), and Western Europe (17 nations).
- Publications: GHM material is developed at Wagner Publications for the purpose of passing on God's words to the public. In one such publication entitled "Destiny of a Nation," they showed how prophetic intercession determined the outcome of the US election of 2000.

Wagner also sees the GHM as playing a role in developing apostolic leadership in today's church. In order to accomplish this task the following groups have been established.

- International Coalition of Apostles (ICA). C. Peter Wagner is the presiding apostle over this organization, and he works closely with John Kelly, Chuck Pierce, and his wife Doris.
- The New Apostolic Roundtable (NAR). This is an accountability group also led by C. Peter Wagner.
- Apostolic Council of Prophet Elders (ACPE). This is a select group of prophets who feel it is necessary to build personal relationships with peer-level prophets.

- Apostolic Council for Educational Accountability (ACEA). This group provides an alternative to traditional standards of accreditation for training centers. Rather than placing a large emphasis on academics, the schools associated with this group impart the gifts of apostle and prophet to serve the New Apostolic Reformation. Some 40 schools currently have membership in this organization.
- Apostolic Roundtable for Deliverance Ministries (ARDM). This is a peer group meeting for those who are involved in deliverance ministries.

There are a lot of committees, groups and associations in the Apostolic Reformation Movement, especially considering there is a belief that structure is counterproductive to its mission.

Toronto Blessing

The Toronto Blessing is a term that was coined by the British media following a revival at the Toronto Airport Vineyard. Some of the manifestations experienced in Toronto were carried back to the Anglican Parish Church of Holy Trinity Brompton (HTB), in London. This revival had international impact as many visitors from around the world took the ‘fire’ back home with them. Among those affected indirectly was Steve Hill, an Assemblies of God evangelist who was instrumental in the Brownsville Revival. Steve Hill actually visited HTB in England and experienced the fire that was brought to that congregation from Toronto.

The founders of the Toronto Airport Christian Fellowship were John and Carol Arnott. The Arnotts visited Argentina in 1993 to look for answers regarding how to get beyond their ‘dry’ ministry, and at that time John received a special anointing. Back in

Toronto, Randy Clark joined the Arnott's. Randy Clark was a Vineyard pastor from St. Louis who had also received a spiritual blessing. At a meeting on January 20, 1994, the Toronto congregation began experiencing an outpouring of the Holy Spirit.³⁰

Following that experience, meetings were held daily where there was great emphasis on healing, especially inner health with respect to things like bitterness and resentment. The main thing the Toronto Blessing offered was spiritual refreshing. It was also widely known for many physical manifestations. It was the unusual physical manifestations that caused the most controversy in these meetings. John Arnott attempted to explain these manifestations by writing a book, but this only served to increase the already existing tension between him and the Vineyard movement with which he was associated. The Vineyard Movement decided to break ties with the Toronto Airport Vineyard in 1995.

One name that was associated with Vineyard from 1992-1996 was Marc Dupont, who was an associate pastor there. Dupont focused on encouraging and releasing spiritual gifts, knowing the times and seasons, unity in the body and restoration of the traditional church.³¹ The Toronto Blessing also developed a renewed emphasis on some Latter Rain teachings that included the five-fold ministry and an emphasis on the imminence of the second coming. They also relied heavily on some prophecies spoken by members of the Kansas City Prophets, especially Paul Cain.

While the initial popularity of the Toronto Blessing has waned, it had a lasting impact on at least one group. The church that brought the Toronto Blessing to the

³⁰M.M. Poloma, "Toronto Blessing," in *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, 1149-1152.

³¹"Mark Dupont Bio," *Mantle of Praise Ministries Incorporated*, September 7, 2003, http://www.mantleofpraise.org/bio_marc.htm.

awareness of the media, the Anglican congregation of Holy Trinity Brompton in London, is the same congregation that distributes the famous Alpha course. The prominent name associated with this group is Nicky Gumbel who had visited the Toronto Blessing. His visit to Toronto has been attributed to his zeal in promoting the Alpha course, and as a result Gumbel and the Alpha course have received an ample amount of criticism from those who consider the events of the Toronto Blessing to be unscriptural.

Brownsville Revival

Leaders of the Brownsville Revival, also known as the Pensacola Outpouring, trace its beginnings back to a prophecy given by David Yonggi Cho while visiting Seattle, Washington in 1993. The Brownsville Revival began on Father's Day 1995 following a prolonged period of intense prayer meetings that were initiated by the senior pastor, John Kilpatrick. Guest speaker Steve Hill, who preached the morning the revival began, continued to preach at Brownsville several years into the revival. Steve Hill was previously mentioned as the gentleman who visited Holy Trinity Brompton in London where he received a blessing. The Brownsville Revival, like the Toronto Blessing, has experienced some physical manifestations that include twitching and jerking uncontrollably.

In 2003 Kilpatrick, the senior pastor of Brownsville Assembly, resigned to answer God's apostolic call on his life. New leaders of the congregation, Randy and Susanne Feldschau, have been appointed to lead Brownsville into apostolic ministry.³²

Congregations that elevate the role of the prophetic word sometimes attribute extraordinary power to all words spoken by believers. It is interesting to note that

³²“Welcome,” *Brownsville Church: Building A Church of Possibilities*, <http://www.brownsvilleag.org/about/index.php?p=history>.

Brownsville, which relies heavily on prophecy, also practices the giving of blessings in their services. These spoken words of blessing are intended to release protection, strength, and prosperity into the lives of those who attend the services at Brownsville. Examples of these blessings are found on the Brownsville website under ‘blessings’ at <http://www.brownsvilleag.org/about/>.

Argentina

In 2002 there was a Harvest City Reaching and Marketplace Conference in Argentina. This period in Argentina’s history was considered a ‘kairos moment,’ as the country was suffering from financial and political upheaval. The term ‘kairos moment’ is popular among those promoting apostolic restoration, and it refers to “times when things can go one way or the other. This word [kairos] means ‘the critical nick of time’ . . .”³³ Since the 2002 conference, spiritual leaders of Argentina have adopted a vision of a New Argentina with the objective of bringing the kingdom of God to an entire nation. They believe that Argentina will be a prototype of what God wants to accomplish around the world, and they suggest that it will establish a new paradigm in the body of Christ. The foundation to this transformation lies in the establishment of apostles in every province of the nation to carry out this vision.³⁴ Generals International lead by Mike and Cindy Jacobs have prophesied extensively over this area.

³³David Cartledge, “Blueprint for Change Conference.”

³⁴“Rebirthing of a ‘New Argentina’: Rescuing a Nation In Crisis,
<http://www.harvestevan.org.za/downloads/NEWARGENTINA.pdf>

Observations

To understand the difficulty of analyzing the restoration movement, it must be stated again that it consists of loosely organized groups, and it is not a denomination. If it were a denomination, the restoration movement would have a doctrinal statement or constitution that could be analyzed. However, the loose structure of this movement does not accommodate such a process. This movement has no governing body that requires conformity to specific doctrines and practices, and so there is little consistency. It is easy for a loosely organized movement to have great diversity in its branches, as is the case with the restoration movement.

One basic truth that is common to the entire movement is that it seeks to restore apostles and prophets to the church, but even on this point differences can be found. While some branches stress apostolic restoration, others focus more on modern prophets. Though the leaders of this movement speak often of the five-fold ministry, there is no evidence that any branch gives equal attention to all five ministry gifts as mentioned in Ephesians 4:11. The reason for this is that more attention is given to the offices apostle and prophet because they are thought to be the two most important. With regard to other elements of doctrine, it is relatively easy to find one or two branches that have the same focus in a specific area, but consistency throughout the movement is obviously lacking.

Whether explaining ecstatic spiritual experiences, giving credibility to leaders and their proclamations, or teaching and preaching to believers, restoration movements focus a lot on the 'new' things God is doing and saying. Continuous presentation of God's 'new' message to the church presents fewer opportunities to focus on the timeless message found in God's word. While some leaders insist that the new things God is

doing must stand up to the scrutiny of scripture, others have no problem adding the new to the old. Along those lines, it is also important to note that many branches of this movement indicate that they give little attention to academia. Because God is revealing a new message to the church, acquiring skills to interpret scripture is not as important as being imparted with spiritual gifts to fulfill the mandate of apostolic and prophetic restoration.

With the establishment of apostolic offices comes the question of how much authority apostles should be given. This is another example of the vast differences that exist in the different branches of this movement. While some attribute final authority to the apostle as one who has heard directly from God, others see the role of the apostle as one that must be carried out in humility and subjection to the authority of scripture and one's peers. It is evident that most branches have struggled with the need to hold apostles and prophets accountable, and despite their strong resistance to structure, many groups have established overseers and committees to accommodate this need.

Branches that focus more on the office of prophet than that of apostle tend to expect prophecy to be given whenever Christians gather. Access to a new word from God for any given person or nation is not so much dependant on God initiating the word as what it is prophets being ready to speak it forth. This makes it easy to plan conferences and conventions for people to come and hear what God has to say.

There is also a tendency to attribute great value to all words spoken by believers. Believing in the power of the spoken word attributes to many diverse doctrinal practices. For some the power of the spoken word leads to a 'name it and claim it' approach to ministry. This can include positive thinking, positive confession, or even the idea that

believers should claim healing and prosperity. In the extreme, there are those who believe that Christians are ‘little gods’ given the authority to speak things into existence, and to overthrow the forces of evil. This is a vital component for those who promote Kingdom Now Theology because believers must have the power to conquer the world and set up God’s kingdom before Christ returns.

Kingdom Now Theology plays a major role in the theology of many branches of the restoration movement. This theology makes a major shift from working until Jesus comes, to establishing his kingdom so that he will come. Establishing his kingdom requires overthrowing the power of Satan, which is understood to be the responsibility of the church (rather than Christ at his coming). This understanding of the church’s mission places a lot of emphasis on spiritual battle, and it is believed that leading the church into the kingdom age is the responsibility of modern apostles.

Conclusion

Those who have devoted themselves to restoring apostles and prophets to the church appear to have nothing but good intentions. It cannot be denied that they have impacted the church in many countries around the world, and the movement as a whole has received a sizable following. Many prominent leaders have abandoned former beliefs regarding the offices of apostle and prophet and their relevance for today, and many denominational leaders have been forced to consider how they should respond to those members who strive to restore these offices. Some people feel compelled to join forces with restoration movement because they see its success as a sign of God’s approval. On the other hand, those who oppose this movement have concerns not only with the

restoration of apostles and prophets, but also with some of the other doctrines being promoted by the different branches of this movement.

It should be noted that the restoration movement does promote the idea of God wanting to speak to the church, they also insist that he wants to move mightily in these days. They have little objection to doing away with methods that have proved unproductive, they believe in releasing people to operate in the gifts, including women, and they focus on youth. There is something to be said about these positive aspects of the movement. When it comes to theology however, it is important for people to investigate this movement closely before joining forces with it.

In reference to those who choose to resist the restoration of apostles and prophets, it is important to avoid putting a lid on all the Spirit's activity for fear of abuse and misuse. As always it is important to provide biblical teaching on the use of the gifts as they were intended to build up the body. As Rick Joyner suggests, it is also important to provide an environment where people can operate in the gifts without feeling condemned if they make a mistake. Proper teaching must be accompanied with careful and loving correction when and if the need arises.

Bibliography

Books

Stanley M. Burgess and Eduard M. Van Der Maas, editors. *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2003.

Wagner, C. Peter Wagner. *Apostles and Prophets: The Foundation of the Church*. Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 2000.

Wimber, John. *Kingdom Come*. Servant Publications. 1988.

Internet Sources

Armin and Julia. "Special Doctrines of the NAC." May 10, 1997, http://www.naki.de/_nak_eng/nak_lehre_e.htm

Bowman, Robert. "The Faulty Foundation of The Five-Fold Ministry." *Apologetics Index*, May 27, 2001. <http://www.apologeticsindex.org/f09.html>

Brownsville Church: Building A House of Possibilities. <http://www.brownsvilleag.org/about/>

Buttner, Charleen. "Latter Rain." *New Religious Movements*. July 19, 2001. <http://religiousmovements.lib.virginia.edu/nrms/Latrain.html>

"Church D. Pierce." *Glory of Zion International Ministries*. 2004. http://www.glory-of-zion.org/pierce_0.htm

Collins, Bruce. "New Wine Sees Encouraging Growth in England." *Anglican Renewal Movement Wales*. October 19, 2002. <http://www.anglicanrenewalministries-wales.org.uk/main/magazine/issue29/BCollins.htm>

Gary A. Hand. "Conversations With A Charismatic." *On Doctrine*, 2002. <http://www.ondoctrine.com/conversa/3char002.htm>.

"Generals International," 2003. <http://www.generals.org/>

Hanegraff, Hank. "The Counterfeit Revival." *Watch Unto Prayer*. Exerts from a 1997 radio broadcast. <http://watch.pair.com/counterfeit.html>

Hunter, Harold. "Centennial Notes." *International Pentecostal Holiness Church*. March 12, 2005. <http://www.iphc.org/docs/timeline/cuba.html>

Johanning, Peter. "The New Apostolic Church: Decentralised Structures and Duties of Ministries." *New Apostolic Church International*. March 5, 2004.
<http://www.nak.org/text/6-gb.html#1>

"Mark Dupont Bio." *Mantle of Praise Ministries Incorporated*. September 7, 2003.
http://www.mantleofpraise.org/bio_marc.htm

Randles, Bill. "The Kansas City Prophets." *Calvary Home Page*.
<http://www.picknowl.com.au/homepages/rlistner/charis/randles/randle7.htm>.

Rebirthing of a 'New Argentina': Rescuing a Nation In Crisis,
<http://www.harvestevan.org.za/downloads/NEWARGENTINA.pdf>

Wagner, C. Peter. "Global Harvest Ministries: Yesterday, Today and Tomorrow!" *Global Harvest Ministries*. 2002. <http://www.globalharvest.org/index.asp?action=about>

Periodicals

Harmon, Cedrick. "God's Lightning Rod." *Charisma and Christian Life*. (26:9) April 2001.

Public Presentation

Cartledge, David. "Blueprint for Change Conference." Hyatt Regency Hotel: DFW Airport, September 19-20, 2002.